



Old and Historic Marblehead Districts Commission

Abbot Hall - 188 Washington Street

Marblehead, Massachusetts 01945

(781) 631-0000

James Patrick, Chairman

Susan Bragdon, Member, Reed Cutting Jr. Member, Thomas Saltsman, Member, Cheryl Boots, Member, Karl C. Renney, Alternate.

April 7th, 2009

Present constituting a quorum: Mr. Patrick, Ms. Boots, Mr. Saltsman, Mr. Cutting, Ms. Bragdon.

Commission Business:

11 R Selman St. -Pat reviewed COA and the project is in compliance. It is currently in process.

7:30 p.m. Chairman James M. Patrick called the meeting to order. Chairman explained that all time parameters would be adhered to in light of the full agenda. Chairman Patrick then outlined Public Hearing process: Presentation by the property owner, comments by the public, and questions/comments by OHDC members.

Chuck Bridges Presentation

7:47 p.m. Board member Tom Saltsman moved, Mr. Cutting seconded, Commission passed motion to close property owner portion of Public Hearing.

1. 17 Middle St.

Chuck Bridges

This is a Public Hearing for: Installation of Marvin "Ultimate Double Hung Windows" with simulated divided lite windows with spacer bar between the glass, all wood installation and half screens. "6 over 6". Previous application was for Pella windows 7/8" profile-simulated divided light.

Issues discussed include: Energy saving importance. Review of double-pane windows approved /storm windows examples "Modern windows look good and make better use of taxpayer's dollars." Problems with wooden storm window-fogging, storage, difficulty to install and remove.

Phil Sweeney, 26 South St. -41 year resident in historic district, Chairman of Electric Light Commission. Does energy efficient audits. Believes aesthetics and environment should be considered.

Appearing in support: Walter Jacob, architect, Chris Heider, Marvin windows representative.

Michael Condon, 15 Middle St.- Supports application for modern windows aesthetically, practically, environmentally.

Cameron Sears, 17 Middle St. – Energy efficient.

Tom Roberts, 48 Lee St. – Double glazed windows installed in his house a year ago with OHDC authorization. New windows look better than old windows.

John Reed, 18 Middle St.- Likes idea that storm windows would be done away with and maybe he could be approved for windows without storms.

Ron Cooper, 1 Middle St. –Windows at 48 Lee St. look good. Why are some houses approved for double pane windows and others not approved?

Francis Gray, 14 South St. – Agrees with application.

John Doub- Submitted letter of support.

Len Conway- Submitted letter of support.

Stating opposition:

Town Counsel has advised OHDC that single decision without exception would be arbitrary and capricious.

Saltsman- Other approvals related to era of house. 17 Middle St. is older house. Location directly on street. Energy conservation comes from insulation. Storm windows provide energy efficiency. Why does building have clapboard but no windows? Marblehead is in middle range of other communities.

Boots-Windows do not comply with expectation of town guidelines; storm windows provide energy savings.

Cutting-Each prior case has its reasons as demonstrated. Preservation has priority in cases of energy savings.

Bragdon-Non-historic houses are not relevant to this. White House and Empire State building are not in an Historic District and not in Marblehead's Historic District. Believes OHDC should no longer approve the double pane, thermal insulated windows at all and should stick with the guidelines single

Pane true divided and add a storm as it is the storm that will protect the window and the homeowner will not have to replace the windows again in 10 years as there is nothing protecting them from the elements.

58 Lee St. Legal technicality-not approved by OHDC. Have attempted to appease public based on distance from the street.

48 Lee St. Legal conundrum. Believes OHDC should no longer approve single pane.

Motion that public phase of hearing be closed. Seconded and passed. 8:04 p.m.

Apologies to Hugh Greville for the delay.

Patrick-Commission has extensive communication with property holders. Historic significance and proximity to public walk way.

Moved that application be denied. Seconded and passed.

It was moved, seconded and voted (5-0) to deny the application.

2. **36 State St.**
 Hugh Greville

This is an application for: Amendment to COA according to submitted drawings-return to clapboard siding (as found under exterior). Remove late addition chimney and improve structural support. Change from 6 over 3 cottage window to 6 over 6 window (2 windows).

Issues discussed include: Chimney dimensions need to be specific as approved by chair. Shed is under pervue of this board.

Appearing in support: Walter Jacob, Architect

It was moved, seconded and voted (5-0) that no estates are materially affected and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for: Remove shingle siding to expose clapboard. Modifications of 2 windows on SE elevation. Removal of one window on NE elevation. Remove late addition chimney and replace with cedar –dimension and materials to be submitted to Selectmen’s office and approved by chair.

3. **35 Washington St.**
 Robert Sooy

No show on application for: Erection of a black wrought iron fence and railing.

4. **101 Front St.**
 Amy Rossi

This is an application for: Gutter of front side of house and copper downspouts.

Issues discussed include: One gutter on front side of house (driveway side of house). Copper downspouts at either end (corner)

It was moved, seconded and voted (5-0) that no estates are materially affected and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for: Installation of wooden gutter and copper downspouts as noted in photographs with application.

5. **13 Hooper St.**
 Ursula Kretschman

This is an application for: Replace existing roof with 3 tab shingles.

It was moved, seconded and voted (5-0) that no estates are materially affected and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for: Replace asphalt shingle roof with 3 tab asphalt shingle roof of like kind.

6. **4 High St.** **Member Susan Bragdon recused herself.**
2-4 High St. Condominium Trust
Robert Bragdon & Susan Bragdon

This is an application for: Replace asphalt shingle 3 tab roofing with like kind. Replace wood gutters as needed with like kind. Change skylight to 3'x2' scuttle and add scuttle not to exceed 3'x2' (match existing)

It was moved, seconded and voted (3-1) that no estates are materially affected and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for: Replace asphalt shingle 3 tab roofing with like. Replace wood gutters as needed with like. Change existing skylight to scuttle and add scuttle 3'x2' or to match the existing-not to exceed 3'x2'.

7. **13 Waldron Ct.**
Nicholas Walton

This is an application for: Replace existing fence in like kind not to exceed existing height.

Issues discussed include: Need for signed approval from abutter before COA can be approved. Height must duplicate existing.

It was moved, seconded and voted (5-0) that no estates are materially affected and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for: Replace fence as is in form and content height to be exactly as is subject to receipt of signature of abutter.

8. **1 Beacon St.**
Stephen & Susan McHugh

This is an application for: Replace approximately 30' of main support beams on deck located on south side of house.

Issues discussed include: Laminated beam used in exterior and are failing. No visible changes. Structural improvements to be finished on exterior as existing.

It was moved, seconded and voted (5-0) that no estates are materially affected and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for: Structural improvements that will not be visible from a public way.

9. **31 Lee St.**
Ann West

This is an application for: Replace existing dirt/grass driveway with brick.

Issues discussed include: Border will stay-cobble stone drive on neighbor's side even though dirt would be more historically accurate, not necessary to retain. Tried sod, but the area didn't work. Must be clay bricks, not design. Options or other green (ivy) with brick tire tracks or cobblestone rejected.

It was moved, seconded and voted (5-0) that no estates are materially affected and to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for: Installation of brick drive area as defined by owner's house and cobblestone to right using red clay water-struck brick.

Meeting adjourned at 9:30 p.m.